

# POLYNOMIAL EXPANSION AND SUBLINEAR SEPARATORS

LOUIS ESPERET AND JEAN-FLORENT RAYMOND

ABSTRACT. Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a class of graphs that is closed under taking subgraphs. We prove that if for some fixed  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ , every  $n$ -vertex graph of  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $O(n^{1-\delta})$ , then any depth- $r$  minor (i.e. minor obtained by contracting disjoint subgraphs of radius at most  $r$ ) of a graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has average degree  $O((r \text{ polylog } r)^{1/\delta})$ . This confirms a conjecture of Dvořák and Norin.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

For an integer  $r \geq 0$ , a *depth- $r$  minor* of a graph  $G$  is a subgraph of a graph that can be obtained from  $G$  by contracting pairwise vertex-disjoint subgraphs of radius at most  $r$ . Let  $d(G)$  denote the average degree of a graph  $G = (V, E)$ , i.e.  $d(G) = 2|E|/|V|$ . For some function  $f$ , we say that a class  $\mathcal{C}$  of graphs has *expansion bounded by  $f$*  if for any graph  $G \in \mathcal{C}$  and any integer  $r$ , any depth- $r$  minor of  $G$  has average degree at most  $f(r)$ . We say that a class has *bounded expansion* if it has expansion bounded by some function  $f$ , and *polynomial expansion* if  $f$  can be taken to be a polynomial.

Classes of bounded expansion play a central role in the study of sparse graphs [7]. From an algorithmic point of view, a very useful property of these classes is that when their expansion is not too large (say subexponential), graphs in the class have sublinear separators. A *separator* in a graph  $G = (V, E)$  is a pair of subsets  $(A, B)$  of vertices of  $G$  such that  $A \cup B = V$  and no edge of  $G$  has one endpoint in  $A \setminus B$  and the other in  $B \setminus A$ . The separator  $(A, B)$  is said to be *balanced* if both  $|A \setminus B|$  and  $|B \setminus A|$  contain at most  $\frac{2}{3}|V|$  vertices. The *order* of the separator  $(A, B)$  is  $|A \cap B|$ .

A class  $\mathcal{C}$  of graphs is *monotone* if for any graph  $G \in \mathcal{C}$ , any subgraph of  $G$  is in  $\mathcal{C}$ . Dvořák and Norin [5] observed that the following can be deduced from a result of Plotkin, Rao, and Smith [8].

**Theorem 1** ([5]). *Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a monotone class of graphs with expansion bounded by  $r \mapsto c(r+1)^{1/4\delta-1}$ , for some constant  $c > 0$  and  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ . Then there is a constant  $C$  such that every  $n$ -vertex graph of  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $Cn^{1-\delta}$ .*

Dvořák and Norin [5] also proved the following partial converse.

---

The first author was supported by ANR Projects STINT (ANR-13-BS02-0007) and GATO (ANR-16-CE40-0009-01) and LabEx PERSYVAL-Lab (ANR-11-LABX-0025-01). The second author was supported by the Polish National Science Centre grant PRELUDIUM DEC-2013/11/N/ST6/02706.

**Theorem 2** ([5]). *Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a monotone class of graphs such that for some fixed constants  $C > 0$  and  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ , every  $n$ -vertex graph of  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $Cn^{1-\delta}$ . Then the expansion of  $\mathcal{C}$  is bounded by some function  $f(r) = O(r^{5/\delta^2})$ .*

They conjectured that the exponent  $5/\delta^2$  of the polynomial expansion in Theorem 2 could be improved to match (asymptotically) that of Theorem 1.

**Conjecture 3** ([5]). *There exists a real  $c > 0$  such that the following holds. Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a monotone class of graphs such that for some fixed constants  $C > 0$  and  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ , every  $n$ -vertex graph of  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $Cn^{1-\delta}$ . Then the expansion of  $\mathcal{C}$  is bounded by some function  $f(r) = O(r^{c/\delta})$ .*

In this short note, we prove this conjecture.

**Theorem 4.** *For any  $C > 0$  and  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ , if a monotone class  $\mathcal{C}$  has the property that every  $n$ -vertex graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order at most  $Cn^{1-\delta}$ , then  $\mathcal{C}$  has expansion bounded by the function  $f : r \mapsto c_1 \cdot (r + 1)^{1/\delta} (\frac{1}{8} \log(r + 3))^{c_2/\delta}$ , for some constants  $c_1$  and  $c_2$  depending only on  $\mathcal{C}$ .*

In particular Conjecture 3 holds for any real number  $c > 1$ . The proof of Theorem 4 is given in the next section, and we conclude with some open problems in Section 3.

## 2. PROOF OF THEOREM 4

We need the following results. The first is a classical connection between balanced separators and tree-width (see [5]).

**Lemma 5.** *Any graph  $G$  has a balanced separator of order at most  $\text{tw}(G) + 1$ .*

Dvořák and Norin [4] proved that the following partial converse holds.

**Theorem 6** ([4]). *If every subgraph of  $G$  has a balanced separator of order at most  $k$ , then  $G$  has tree-width at most  $105k$ .*

Note that in our proof of Theorem 4 we could also use the weaker (and easier) result of [1] that under the same hypothesis,  $G$  has tree-width at most  $1 + k \log |V(G)|$ , but the computation is somewhat less cumbersome if we use Theorem 6 instead.

For a set  $S$  of vertices in a graph  $G$ , we let  $N(S)$  denote the set of vertices not in  $S$  with at least one neighbor in  $S$ . We will use the following result of Shapira and Sudakov [9].

**Theorem 7** ([9]). *Any graph  $G$  contains a subgraph  $H$  of average degree  $d(H) \geq \frac{255}{256}d(G)$  such that for any set  $S$  of at most  $n/2$  vertices of  $H$  (where  $n = |V(H)|$ ),  $|N(S)| \geq \frac{1}{2^8 \log n (\log \log n)^2} |S|$ .*

In fact, we will only need a much weaker version, where the vertex-expansion is of order  $\Omega\left(\frac{1}{\text{polylog } n}\right)$  instead of  $\Omega\left(\frac{1}{\log n (\log \log n)^2}\right)$ .

Finally, we need a result of Chekuri and Chuzhoy [2] on bounded-degree subgraphs of large tree-width in a graph of large tree-width.

**Theorem 8** ([2]). *There are constants  $\alpha, \beta$  such that for any integer  $k \geq 2$ , any graph  $G$  of tree-width at least  $k$  contains a subgraph  $H$  of tree-width at least  $\alpha k / (\log k)^\beta$  and maximum degree 3.*

Let us remark that instead of Theorem 8, our proof of Theorem 4 could rely on an earlier result of Chekuri and Chuzhoy [3] which, under the same assumptions, merely guarantees the existence of a subgraph of  $G$  of treewidth  $\Omega(k/(\log k)^6)$  and maximum degree  $O((\log k)^3)$ .

We are now ready to prove our main result.

*Proof of Theorem 4.* Let  $G$  be a graph of  $\mathcal{C}$  and let  $F$  be a depth- $r$  minor of  $G$ . Our goal is to prove that  $d(F) \leq c_1 \cdot (r+1)^{1/\delta} (\frac{1}{\delta} \log(r+3))^{c_2/\delta}$ , for some constants  $c_1$  and  $c_2$  depending only on  $\mathcal{C}$ . Note that for any  $r \geq 0$  and  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ ,

$$c_1 \cdot (r+1)^{1/\delta} (\frac{1}{\delta} \log(r+3))^{c_2/\delta} \geq \max \left\{ c_1 (\log 3)^{c_2}, c_1 \exp\left(\frac{c_2}{\delta} \log \frac{\log 3}{\delta}\right) \right\},$$

so we can assume without loss of generality that

$$d(F) \geq \max \left\{ 10^8, \exp \left( 4 \cdot \frac{\beta+3}{\delta} \log \left( 2 \cdot \frac{\beta+3}{\delta} \right) \right) \right\}$$

by choosing appropriate values of  $c_1, c_2$ . By Theorem 7,  $F$  has a subgraph  $H$  of average degree  $d(H) \geq \frac{255}{256} d(F)$  such that for any set  $S$  of at most  $|V(H)|/2$  vertices of  $H$ ,

$$|N(S)| \geq \frac{1}{2^{8 \log |V(H)| (\log \log |V(H)|)^2}} |S| \geq \frac{1}{2^{8 (\log |V(H)|)^3}} |S|.$$

It follows from Lemma 5 that  $H$  contains a balanced separator  $(A, B)$  with  $|A \cap B| \leq \text{tw}(H) + 1$ . As  $A \setminus B$  and  $B \setminus A$  are disjoint, one of them contains at most half of the vertices. We may assume without loss of generality that  $|A \setminus B| \leq |V(H)|/2$ . As  $N(A \setminus B) \subseteq A \cap B$ , we get

$$|A \cap B| \geq \frac{1}{2^{8 (\log |V(H)|)^3}} |A \setminus B|.$$

Since  $(A, B)$  is balanced,  $|A \setminus B| + |A \cap B| \geq \frac{1}{3} |V(H)|$  and so

$$\frac{1}{3} |V(H)| \leq |A \cap B| (1 + 2^8 (\log |V(H)|)^3).$$

Given that  $|A \cap B| \leq \text{tw}(H) + 1$ , we deduce

$$\text{tw}(H) \geq \frac{|V(H)|}{3 \cdot 2^8 (\log |V(H)|)^3 + 3} - 1 \geq \frac{|V(H)|}{2^{10} (\log |V(H)|)^3},$$

using that  $|V(H)| \geq d(H) \geq \frac{255}{256} \cdot 10^8$ .

By Theorem 8,  $H$  has a subgraph  $H'$  of maximum degree 3 such that

$$\text{tw}(H') \geq \frac{\alpha \text{tw}(H)}{(\log \text{tw}(H))^\beta} \geq \frac{\alpha |V(H)|}{2^{10} (\log |V(H)|)^{\beta+3}},$$

since  $\text{tw}(H) \leq |V(H)|$ . Note that  $H'$  is a subgraph of  $H$  (and  $F$ ) and therefore also a depth- $r$  minor of  $G$ . In  $G$ ,  $H'$  corresponds to a subgraph  $G'$  (before contraction of the subgraphs of radius  $r$ ) with  $|V(G')| \leq (3r+1)|V(H')| \leq (3r+1)|V(H)|$ . Indeed, since  $H'$  has maximum degree 3, each subgraph of radius at most  $r$  in  $G'$  whose contraction

corresponds to a vertex of  $H'$  contains at most  $3r + 1$  vertices. Since  $H'$  is a minor of  $G'$ , we have

$$\text{tw}(G') \geq \text{tw}(H') \geq \frac{\alpha |V(H)|}{2^{10} (\log |V(H)|)^{\beta+3}}.$$

Since  $\mathcal{C}$  is monotone, every subgraph of  $G'$  is in  $\mathcal{C}$  and thus has a balanced separator of order at most  $C|V(G')|^{1-\delta}$ . Hence, by Theorem 6,

$$\text{tw}(G') \leq 105C|V(G')|^{1-\delta} \leq 2^7 C|V(G')|^{1-\delta}.$$

We just obtained lower and upper bounds on  $\text{tw}(G')$ . Putting them together, we obtain:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\alpha |V(H)|}{2^{10} (\log |V(H)|)^{\beta+3}} &\leq 2^7 C |V(G')|^{1-\delta} \\ &\leq 2^7 C ((3r + 1)|V(H)|)^{1-\delta}, \text{ and thus} \\ \frac{|V(H)|^\delta}{(\log |V(H)|)^{\beta+3}} &\leq \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1)^{1-\delta} \\ &\leq \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1), \text{ and} \\ |V(H)| &\leq \left( \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1) (\log |V(H)|)^{\beta+3} \right)^{1/\delta}. \end{aligned}$$

It follows that

$$\log |V(H)| \leq \frac{1}{\delta} \log \left( \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1) \right) + \frac{\beta+3}{\delta} \log \log |V(H)|.$$

Since the function  $n \mapsto \frac{\log n}{\log \log n}$  is increasing for  $n \geq 16$ , a direct consequence of our initial assumption that  $|V(H)| \geq \exp \left( 4 \cdot \frac{\beta+3}{\delta} \log \left( 2 \cdot \frac{\beta+3}{\delta} \right) \right)$  is that

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\log |V(H)|}{\log \log |V(H)|} &\geq 2 \cdot \frac{\beta+3}{\delta}, \text{ and thus} \\ \log |V(H)| &\leq \frac{2}{\delta} \log \left( \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1) \right). \end{aligned}$$

We conclude that

$$|V(H)| \leq \left( \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1) \left( \frac{2}{\delta} \log \left( \frac{2^{17} C}{\alpha} (3r + 1) \right) \right)^{\beta+3} \right)^{1/\delta} \leq \frac{255}{256} c_1 (r + 1)^{1/\delta} \left( \frac{1}{\delta} \log(r + 3) \right)^{c_2/\delta},$$

for some constants  $c_1, c_2$  depending only on  $C$  and the constants  $\alpha, \beta$  of Theorem 8. Recall that  $d(F) \leq \frac{256}{255} d(H)$ . Since  $d(H) \leq |V(H)|$ , we obtain  $d(F) \leq c_1 \cdot (r + 1)^{1/\delta} \left( \frac{1}{\delta} \log(r + 3) \right)^{c_2/\delta}$ , as desired. This concludes the proof of Theorem 4.  $\square$

### 3. OPEN PROBLEMS

A natural problem is to determine the infimum real  $c > 0$ , such that if a monotone class  $\mathcal{C}$  has the property that every  $n$ -vertex graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $O(n^{1-\delta})$ , then  $\mathcal{C}$  has expansion bounded by some function  $r \mapsto O(r^{c/\delta})$ . Theorem 4 implies that  $c \leq 1$ . On the other hand, it directly follows from Theorem 1 that  $c \leq \frac{1}{4+\epsilon}$  would imply that if any  $n$ -vertex graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $O(n^{1-\delta})$ , then any  $n$ -vertex graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has a balanced separator of order  $O(n^{1-(1+\epsilon/4)\delta})$ . Therefore, Theorem 1

implies that  $c \geq \frac{1}{4}$  (moreover, the proof of Theorem 1 in [5] can be slightly optimized to show that  $c \geq \frac{1}{2}$ ). A good candidate to prove a better lower bound for  $c$  would be the family of all finite subgraphs of the infinite  $d$ -dimensional grid. The  $n$ -vertex graphs in this class have balanced separators of order  $O(n^{1-1/d})$  (see [6]), and it might be the case that they have expansion  $\Omega(r^{cd})$  for some  $c > \frac{1}{2}$ .

One way to measure the sparsity of a class of graphs is via its expansion (as defined in Section 1). Another way (which turns out to be equivalent) is via its *generalized coloring parameters*. Given a linear order  $L$  on the vertices of a graph  $G$ , and an integer  $r$ , we say that a vertex  $v$  of  $G$  is *strongly  $r$ -reachable* from a vertex  $u$  (with respect to  $L$ ) if  $v \leq_L u$ , and there is a path  $P$  of length at most  $r$  between  $u$  and  $v$ , such that  $u <_L w$  for any internal vertex  $w$  of  $P$ . If we only require that  $v$  is the minimum of the vertices of  $P$  (with respect to  $L$ ), we say that  $v$  is *weakly  $r$ -reachable* from  $u$ . The *strong  $r$ -coloring number*  $\text{col}_r(G)$  of  $G$  is the minimum integer  $k$  such that there is a linear order  $L$  on the vertices of  $G$  such that for any vertex  $u$  of  $G$ , at most  $k$  vertices are strongly  $r$ -reachable from  $u$  (with respect to  $L$ ). By replacing *strongly* by *weakly* in the previous definition, we obtain the *weak  $r$ -coloring number*  $\text{wcol}_r(G)$  of  $G$ . Note that for any graph  $G$  and any integer  $r$ ,  $\text{col}_r(G) \leq \text{wcol}_r(G)$ . For more on these parameters and their connections with the expansion of graph classes, the reader is referred to [7].

As we have seen before, it follows from [5] that a monotone class of graphs has polynomial expansion if and only if, for some fixed  $0 < \delta \leq 1$ , each  $n$ -vertex graph in the class has a balanced separator of order  $O(n^{1-\delta})$ . Joret and Wood asked whether this is also equivalent to having weak and strong  $r$ -coloring numbers bounded by a polynomial function of  $r$ .

**Problem 9** (Joret and Wood, 2017). *Assume that  $\mathcal{C}$  is a monotone class of graphs. Are the following statements equivalent?*

- (1)  $\mathcal{C}$  has polynomial expansion.
- (2) There exists a constant  $c$ , such that for every  $r$ , every graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has strong  $r$ -coloring number at most  $O(r^c)$ .
- (3) There exists a constant  $c$ , such that for every  $r$ , every graph in  $\mathcal{C}$  has weak  $r$ -coloring number at most  $O(r^c)$ .

Note that clearly (3) implies (2). It was known that (3) implies (1) (this is a consequence of Lemma 7.11 in [7]), and Norin recently made the following observation, which shows that (2) implies (1).

**Observation 10** (Norin, 2017). *Every depth- $r$  minor of a graph  $G$  has average degree at most  $2 \text{col}_{4r}(G)$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $L$  be a linear order on the vertices of  $G$ , such that for any vertex  $v$  of  $G$ , at most  $\text{col}_r(G)$  vertices are strongly  $r$ -reachable from  $v$  (with respect to  $L$ ). Let  $H$  be a depth- $r$  minor of a graph  $G$ . For any vertex  $u$  of  $H$ , let  $S_u$  be a subgraph of  $G$  of radius at most  $r$ , such that the  $S_u$ 's are vertex-disjoint and for any edge  $uv$  of  $H$ , there is an edge in  $G$  between a vertex of  $S_u$  and a vertex of  $S_v$ . It is enough to prove that there is a linear order  $L'$  on the vertices of  $H$  such that any vertex  $u$  of  $H$ , at most  $\text{col}_{4r}(G)$  vertices of  $H$  are strongly 1-reachable from  $u$ .

We construct  $L'$  from  $L$  as follows: for  $u, v$  in  $H$ , we set  $u <_{L'} v$  if and only if, with respect to  $L$ , the smallest vertex of  $S_u$  precedes the smallest vertex of  $S_v$ . This clearly defines a linear order on the vertices of  $H$ . Consider a vertex  $u$  of  $H$  and let  $x$  be the smallest vertex of  $S_u$  (with respect to  $L$ ). Let  $v$  be a neighbor of  $u$  in  $H$  with  $v <_{L'} u$  (i.e.  $v$  is strongly 1-reachable from  $u$  in  $H$ ). Let  $t \in S_u$  and  $z \in S_v$  be such that  $tz$  is an edge of  $G$ . Observe that there is a path  $P_u$  from  $x$  to  $t$  in  $S_u$  (and  $x$  is the smallest vertex in this path with respect to  $L$ ), and a path  $P_v$  from  $z$  to  $y$  in  $S_v$ . Let  $w$  be the first vertex of  $P_v$  such that  $w <_L x$  (note that possibly  $w = z$ ). The concatenation of  $P_u$ ,  $zt$ , and the subpath of  $P_v$  between  $z$  and  $w$  has length at most  $4r$  and thus shows that  $w$  is strongly  $4r$ -reachable from  $x$  in  $G$ . Hence, at most  $\text{col}_{4r}(G)$  vertices of  $H$  are strongly 1-reachable from  $u$  in  $H$  with respect to  $L'$ , as desired.  $\square$

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Zdeněk Dvořák for the discussion about [5], Gwenaël Joret and David Wood for allowing us to mention Problem 9, and Sergey Norin for allowing us to mention Observation 10 and its proof.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] H.L. Bodlaender, J.R. Gilbert, H. Hafsteinsson, and T. Kloks, *Approximating treewidth, pathwidth, frontsize, and shortest elimination tree*, J. Algorithms **18(2)** (1995), 238–255.
- [2] C. Chekuri and J. Chuzhoy, *Degree-3 Treewidth Sparsifiers*, In Proc. of the 26th Annual ACM-SIAM Symposium on Discrete Algorithms (2015), 242–255.
- [3] C. Chekuri and J. Chuzhoy, *Large-treewidth graph decompositions and applications*, In Proc. of the 45th Annual ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing (2013), 291–300.
- [4] Z. Dvořák and S. Norin, *Treewidth of graphs with balanced separations*, Manuscript, 2014. [arXiv:1408.3869](https://arxiv.org/abs/1408.3869)
- [5] Z. Dvořák and S. Norin, *Strongly sublinear separators and polynomial expansion*, SIAM J. Discrete Math. **30(2)** (2016), 1095–1101.
- [6] G. L. Miller, S.-H. Teng and S. Vavasis, *A unified geometric approach to graph separators*, In Proc. of the 32nd Annual Symposium on Foundations of Computer Science (1991), 538–547.
- [7] J. Nešetřil and P. Ossona de Mendez, *Sparsity – Graphs, Structures, and Algorithms*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, 2012.
- [8] S. Plotkin, S. Rao, and W.D. Smith, *Shallow excluded minors and improved graph decomposition*, In Proc. of the 5th Annual ACM-SIAM Symposium on Discrete Algorithms (1994), 462–470.
- [9] A. Shapira and B. Sudakov, *Small Complete Minors Above the Extremal Edge Density*, Combinatorica **35(1)** (2015), 75–94.

UNIV. GRENOBLE ALPES, CNRS, G-SCOP, GRENOBLE, FRANCE  
*E-mail address:* louis.esperet@grenoble-inp.fr

INSTITUTE OF INFORMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF WARSAW, POLAND AND LIRMM, UNIVERSITY OF MONTPELLIER, FRANCE  
*E-mail address:* jean-florent.raymond@mimuw.edu.pl